

**STATE OF RHODE ISLAND AND PROVIDENCE PLANTATIONS
PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION**

IN RE: NARRAGANSETT ELECTRIC : DOCKET NO. 4065
COMPANY d/b/a NATIONAL GRID :

**RESPONSE OF THE DIVISION OF PUBLIC UTILITIES AND CARRIERS TO
THE COMMISSION'S THIRD DATA REQUEST**

January 12, 2010

2. Does a change in capital structure affect the mechanics of the DCF calculation?

Response

Generally speaking, a change in capital structure does not alter the mechanics of the DCF analysis used to determine the applicable cost of equity. If the proposed capital structure differs markedly from the DCF proxy group average capital structure, then such difference may warrant an adjustment to the proxy group DCF finding. However, if such an adjustment is deemed appropriate, this would be an external adjustment after the DCF analysis has been completed. It is not part of the DCF "mechanics" itself.

**STATE OF RHODE ISLAND AND PROVIDENCE PLANTATIONS
PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION**

IN RE: NARRAGANSETT ELECTRIC : DOCKET NO. 4065
COMPANY d/b/a NATIONAL GRID :

**RESPONSE OF THE DIVISION OF PUBLIC UTILITIES AND CARRIERS TO
THE COMMISSION'S THIRD DATA REQUEST
January 12, 2010**

3. If the RI Commission were to approve a capital structure for Narragansett Electric that consisted of 38% equity and 62% debt, what effect, if any, would that have on the Division's recommendation for an appropriate ROE.

Response

The Division has not conducted a formal analysis of the cost of equity implications of a 38/62 capital structure. However, since this capital structure differs significantly from that assumed by the Division (and implicit in the Division's two proxy groups), it is possible that the Division would modify its return on equity recommendation above the 10.1 percent current figure. For example, the upper end of Staff's DCF range is 10.45 percent, and a figure toward this upper end may be a more reasonable award than the 10.1 percent midpoint if the ratemaking capital structure is determined to be 38 percent equity/62 percent debt. The 10.45 percent is the average of the electric proxy group upper bound DCF of 10.7 percent and the gas proxy group DCF upper bound of 10.2 percent. (See Schedules MIK-4 and 5, page 1 of 4.)

In evaluating a revised range of 10.1 to 10.45 percent in conjunction with a 38/62 capital structure, the Commission may wish to consider additional factors:

**STATE OF RHODE ISLAND AND PROVIDENCE PLANTATIONS
PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION**

IN RE: NARRAGANSETT ELECTRIC : DOCKET NO. 4065
COMPANY d/b/a NATIONAL GRID :

**RESPONSE OF THE DIVISION OF PUBLIC UTILITIES AND CARRIERS TO
THE COMMISSION'S THIRD DATA REQUEST
January 12, 2010**

Data Response No. 3 (Cont'd)

- The CAPM produces cost of equity estimates lower than the DCF.
- The Division's cost of equity DCF studies used market data through August 2009. Equity markets have improved since then.
- While the Division's proxy companies have capital structures less leveraged than 38/62 equity debt, as posed in the question, some of these proxy companies have riskier non-regulated operations. Inevitably, some of that additional risk is captured in the DCF calculations.

For these reasons, the Commission should consider a return on equity range of 10.1 to 10.45 percent if it adopts a 38/62 capital structure, but no higher than 10.45 percent.