## TORNEY CERTIFICATION OF RHODE BUT

## State of Rhode Island and Providence Plantations

## **DEPARTMENT OF ATTORNEY GENERAL**

150 South Main Street • Providence, RI 02903 (401) 274-4400 - TDD (401) 453-0410

Peter F. Kilmartin, Attorney General

December 19, 2013

Ms. Luly Massaro, Clerk Public Utilities Commission 89 Jefferson Blvd Warwick, RI 02889

**Re:** Docket Nos. 3762 and 3764

Dear Ms. Massaro,

Enclosed for filing on behalf of the Division of Public Utilities and Carriers in the above matters, please find a Memorandum from Division rate consultant David J. Effron, CPA to Stephen Scialabba. Included with the memorandum is a schedule of Interstate Navigation Company's earnings during the rate plan, as prepared by Mr. Effron. This is filed in response to the October 10, 2013 submission of Michael McElroy in this docket which included a memorandum from Walter Edge, CPA regarding Interstate Navigation Company's accumulated earnings during the period of the regulatory rate plan approved in docket 3762.

The Division agrees with the conclusions of Mr. Edge that Interstate's final accumulated earnings calculation for the six year rate plan did not reach the threshold for earnings sharing, and there is therefore no need to issue refunds to ratepayers, or otherwise deal with any excess earnings.

Very truly yours

L**&** J. Wold

Assistant Attorney General

November 26, 2013

To: Stephen Scialabba

From: David J. Effron

Subject: Interstate Navigation Company

Final Accumulated Earnings Report

The Settlement of Commission Docket No. 3762 required that Interstate Navigation Company file a Final Accumulated Earnings Report to determine the extent to which Interstate's earnings for the period covered by the Settlement exceeded a return on equity if 12.50% on a cumulative basis. Attached is a schedule that calculates the earnings in excess of 12.50% for the period 2007-2012. As can be seen on this schedule, the earnings for these years did not produce a return on equity in excess of 12.50% on a cumulative basis. Therefore, there are no excess earnings to share with customers. It should be noted that Interstate does not agree in all respects with the Division's calculation of applicable earnings. However, all parties are in agreement that the earnings for the years 2007 – 2012 did not produce a cumulative return on equity in excess of 12.50%.

David J. Effron

David J. Ggun

## Interstate Navigation Company Final Accumulated Earnings Report (CY 2007-2012)

		2007	2008	2009	<u>2010</u>	<u>2011</u>	2012
Revenues Operating Expenses		11,851,405 10,075,445	12,714,448 11,616,454	11,229,094 10,483,399	11,875,088 10,680,258	12,523,618 11,761,320	13,010,629 12,062,102
Pre-Tax Profit per Trial Balance		1,775,959	1,097,994	745,695	1,194,831	762,298	948,527
Amortize 2006 Fast Ferry Profit		1,773,939	121,916	121,916	1,194,031	102,290	940,321
Fast Ferry Depreciation & Amortization		262,167	262,167	262,167	262,167	262,167	262,167
Rate Case Expense Amortization		(83,333)	(83,333)	(83,333)	202,101	202,107	202,107
Excess Homeland Security		82,147	8,977	6,005	(42,254)	105,325	(74,057)
Fast Ferry Principal		(82,420)	(87,480)	(95,200)	(102,360)	(110,040)	(117,880)
Fast Ferry Interest		(404,799)	(399,092)	(392,764)	(384,981)	(377,354)	(370,176)
Interest on Debt Supporting Rate Bas 4.46%		(507,705)	(458,855)	(416,708)	(373,312)	(326,986)	(297,544)
Pre-Tax Profit per Rate Plan		1,163,932	462,293	147,779	554,091	315,410	351,037
Income Taxes		395,737	157,180	40,884	188,391	106,260	119,353
Net Income	Α	768,195	305,114	106,895	365,700	209,150	231,684
Rate Base		11,383,121	10,287,864	9,342,895	8,369,929	7,331,253	6,671,146
Common Equity Ratio		30.31%	30.31%	30.31%	30.31%	30.31%	30.31%
Ceiling ROE		<u>12.50%</u>	<u>12.50%</u>	<u>12.50%</u>	<u>12.50%</u>	<u>12.50%</u>	<u>12.50%</u>
Ceiling Net Income	В	431,278	389,781	353,979	317,116	277,763	252,753
Excess Earnings	A - B	336,917	(84,668)	(247,084)	48,584	(68,613)	(21,069)
Cumulative Excess Earnings		336,917	252,250	5,166	53,750	(14,863)	(35,932)

Sources: Interstate Navigation trial balances 2007-2012.